

LGBTIQ EMPLOYMENT EQUALITY INDEX



KOSOVO MAY, 2018

a product of **HeadHunter**®

Executive Summary	4		
Key Findings and Recommendations	5		
The 2018 Rated Companies About the LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index Methodology	7 9 11		
		Key Findings and Analysis	13
		Section I: Basic Information for Companies	14
Section II: Policies and Procedures	15		
Section III: Policies for Recruitment and Employee Retention	22		
Section IV: Corporate Social Responsibility and Outreach	30		
Section V: LGBTIQ Specific Initiatives and Actions	36		
Recommendations	37		

The Headhunter Kosovo is pleased to announce and publish the findings of its first annual LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index in Kosovo.

When first initiating this idea, there were many naysayers. They claimed that the Kosovar private sector would not bother to participate. They claimed that the Kosovar public would not care. Thanks to our own convictions on the right to employment for all citizens as well as a number of international actors in the country, we preserved. We are firm in our conviction that all Kosovar citizens—regardless of any quality or status—have something to contribute to the country and they have the right to employment. We also drew experience and expertise from the Index in Albania, when The Headhunter faced the same criticism but then found a surprising degree of participation and interest.

The results surprised even us: a total of 65 companies participated in the first annual process, and a few actually demonstrated concrete policies and measures in place to protect the rights and uphold the dignity of LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees. This first year's awardees will be announced at the awards ceremony on May 17, 2018.

These awardees have already taken concrete measures to protect LGBTIQ Kosovars. They set an admirable example for other employers in the country to follow. They also recognize that upholding the rights of any group benefits all of society. We are humbled that they agreed to participate in our Index and we are inspired by their commitment.

#### Key Findings and Recommendations

While The Headhunter Kosovo was pleased at the enthusiastic response to participating in the rating process, the results show that companies in Kosovo have very little in the way of human resource policies and practices to protect and uphold the rights and dignity of minority job-seekers and employees. Unfortunately, this finding does not come as a surprise to most. Those which do include some policies and practices do not specifically extend them to LGBTIQ Kosovars.

A moderate number of these companies support community-based organizations and charities, and are willing to do more in terms of minority professional inclusion. Few of the businesses interviewed for this rating process mentioned their willingness to upgrade and improve their recruitment and HR management procedures to be more inclusive, accessible and secure to LGBTIQ candidatures and employees.

Some companies stated that in the very near future they will be adopting the EU version for the employment policies. From 65 companies interviewed only three of them have EU adopted policies, where non-discrimination and equal employment opportunity policy contain the terms 'sexual orientation', 'gender identity' and 'gender conformity'.. The majority of the companies when they answered 'no' in Question 4.4 (did these donations and sponsorships include support for LGBTIQ organizations or events?) said that they will very much like to help/donate, if LGBTIQ organizations would approached them. The Headhunter Kosovo sees both a tremendous need and demand for trainings on workplace diversity for companies in Kosovo as well as standardized policies and practices which companies can adapt. You will notice from the statistics that we have included, that only 20% of the companies have managers and leaders trained to manage nondiscrimination and equal employment opportunity while this number drops to 16% for other employees.

Another concerning statistic is that 35% of the companies have a mechanism to report discrimination based on gender identity or sexual orientation, but only 15% of them are trained to handle these situations. Following the in-depth process conducted in April and May, Headhunter Kosovo tabulated the results for each of the 65 companies which participated and a total of **three** companies managed to win three awards and five of them won certificates.

#### Interpretation of the Ratings

Each answer receives a fixed number of points, and the points are added up for a total score. The Ranking is divided into 4 categories: **gold, silver, bronze,** and **non-rated.** Gold is the highest ranking allocated to companies with outstanding performance, support and inclusion of LGBTIQ in the workforce specifically. Only companies which specifically identify LGBTIQ persons in their human resources policies and practices can reach Gold level.

Rankings are provided using 4 tiers:

- **Gold:** refers to companies which specifically mention protection for the rights and dignity of LGBTIQ job seekers and employees in their human resource policies and practices. They will have a demonstrated track record of promoting equality and dignity for LGBTIQ job seekers and employees through their actions and employee relations. These companies also demonstrate compliance with the Kosovar law on non-discrimination.
- Silver: refers to companies which have policies and practices to protect the dignity of LGBTIQ job seekers and employees, but may not have a demonstrated track record of actions to do so. Their policies mention LGBTIQ specifically. These companies demonstrate compliance with the Kosovar law on nondiscrimination.

- **Bronze:** refers to companies with general policies on protection of rights and dignity for employees, but without specific mention to LGBTIQ job seekers and employees. These companies demonstrate compliance with the Kosovar law on non-discrimination.
- **Non-rated:** All other companies and employers will be considered as non-rated. These companies lack policies and practices to protect the rights and dignity of LGBTIQ job seekers and employees. These companies do not show compliance with the Kosovar law on non-discrimination.

This ranking is intended to provide encouragement and the opportunity to the Headhunter Kosovo to offer its services in terms of technical assistance, advice and training.

# ABOUT THE LGBTIQ EMPLOYMENT EQUALITY INDEX

The LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index is the first of its kind in Kosovo as well as in the non-EU states of the Balkans. The LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index is a ranking system to determine how well companies respect the rights and dignity of LGBTIQ persons in their hiring, training, development, and general employment practices. In addition, it rates their compliance with local labor laws on the topic.

The Index has been carried in Albania and Bosnia and Herzegovina, and is now being presented in Kosovo in 2018. The Headhunter is in the planning phase of carrying out the Index in further countries in the coming years as well.

The Headhunter Group, the largest recruitment and human resource company in Albania and one of the largest in the Balkans, has decided to launch such an Index as part of its commitment to Corporate Social Responsibility and Workplace Diversity. The Headhunter Kosovo, part of The Headhunter Group, has an intrinsic commitment to see equal employment opportunities extended to all citizens. The Group is also well-placed to create and launch such an Index, as it has the credibility within the private sector to act as a judge of human resource policies impartially.

Each year, on or around the International Day of Homophobia, Transphobia, and Biphobia (on May 17), the Headhunter Group presents awards to the companies which have been exemplary in protecting the rights and upholding the dignity of LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees. This year The Headhunter Kosovo's LGBTIQ Employment Index measures the policies and practices practices of companies operating in Kosovo towards LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees. The Headhunter Group staff interview directors and verify policies and practices of both international and Kosovar companies each year.

Information on the Index can be accessed at: http://headhunter.al/lgbtiq-index

The LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index is an important expression of The Headhunter Group's corporate social responsibility efforts. The Headhunter Group is active in supporting a number of issues related to employment for youth, women and girls, and minorities. In 2015, it founded RINI Albania to carry out charitable activities in favor of youth employment and workplace diversity.

The LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index was created by a team of experts from SFV Consulting Group (www.sfvconsulting.com). In addition to its core consulting services, the Group has conducted a number of activities for LGBTIQ-focused projects and organizations, including a worldwide donor compendium, multiple trainings to LGBTIQ-focused organizations, and one of the world's first ever research studies on LGBTIQ refugees from Syria. The Headhunter Kosovo has designed a methodical and verifiable process of rating the companies according to the Index.

#### Company Self-Selection

Participation in the LGBTIQ Employment Equality Index is entirely voluntary. The Headhunter Kosovo offers participation to companies and also responds to companies which wish to participate in the Index. It should be noted that all statements in this report should recognize that they are based on a voluntary participation and are not representative of the Kosovar private sector as a whole.

#### **On-Site Rating Process**

Expert staff from The Headhunter Kosovo use a standardized questionnaire to rate each company, and conduct an on-site interview with the Human Resources Department, Manager, or other qualified staff person. The Headhunter Group staff verify each answer on site as well, verifying policies and procedures.

#### Rating Issuance

Upon completing the interview and returning to The Headhunter Kosovo offices, the staff then tabulate the scores for each answer and issue a rating based upon a pre-determined scale. The results for each company are transparent, verifiable, and auditable.



# KEY FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

This section contains some key findings from the **65** company ratings. They are presented here to show important trends and gain insights into the status of Kosovo's private sector in upholding the rights and dignity of LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees.

### SECTION I: BASIC INFORMATION FOR COMPANIES

The staff of The Headhunter Kosovo conducted ratings on a total of 65 companies.

As shown in *Chart 1* above, the majority of companies which participated in this year's rating were well-established companies. **61**% of those companies had less than 50 employees, **25**% had over 100 employees and **14**% had between 51 and 100 employees. Companies participating in the rating came from a wide range of industries but the most common were from Banking **22**%, Hotels and casinos **12**%, Food and beverages **11**%, Retail, Colleges and Universities **8**%, Telecommunication, Pharmaceuticals, Entertainments **5**%, Engineering and Construction, Automotive, Consulting and Business Services **3**%, Healthcare and Hospitals, Apparel and fashion **2**%.

#### Chart 1: Number of Employees



## SECTION II: POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

Questions in the second section asked companies about the policies they have in place.

**95%** of companies currently have a policy for non-discrimination and equal opportunity for all employees. This question is not specifically for LGBTIQ persons but for all persons, this shows that in Kosovo culture of non-discrimination is going in the right direction, but there is still room for improvement regarding LGBTIQ in the work place.

#### Chart 2: Non-Discrimination and Equal Employment Opportunity Policy



In *Chart 3* below, companies were asked if the policy is specific to LGBTIQ and related status. 43% of the companies had policies which contained only gender identity, 32% none of these terms and only 22% had policies which contained language related to LGBTIQ and related status, again highlighting the fact that employment policies as yet do not sufficiently protect LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees.

#### Chart 3: LGBTIQ Specific Mentions in Non-Discrimination Policies





As noted in *Chart 4* above, only **37%** of companies rated have a specific manager (usually a human resources manager or legal representative) who has a specific mandate to ensure nondiscrimination and equal opportunity for staff. This again highlights the fact that—not only do companies not have policies in place—they also lack the human resource skills and mandates to put those policies into place. Furthermore, without having staff specifically charged with this issue, it is assumed that many of these companies lack a champion for these rights within the management structure.

#### Chart 4: Specific Mandate for Non-Discrimination and Equality Opportunity

Question 2.3.: does the company have a Human Resources Manager or a Senior Manager, with a mission mandate or a specific responsibility that includes non discrimination or equal employment opportunity?



*Chart 5* below reinforces this point, showing that no companies at all had a staff member with specific mandates to include LGBTIQ persons in the company's human resource structure and policies. Which is a very concerning statistic.

#### Chart 5: Specific LGBTIQ Mention in the Mandate



*Chart 6* below describes the extent to which companies actually train their human resource managers or other directors on non-discrimination and equal opportunity. Unsurprisingly, only 6% reported that they do. The Headhunter Kosovo finds this statistic troubling because 95% of companies reported having such policies (see *Chart 2* above) but only 6% actually train their management on implementing such policies. This leads one to believe that those policies in companies without trained management are likely unenforced or weakly enforced at best.

#### Chart 6: Training for Human Resources and Management



In *Chart 7* below, the Index asked if the company provides training on non-discrimination and equal opportunity to all employees. This is important as it relates to the working culture and atmosphere in the company. Only **26**% of companies offer such training.

#### Chart 7: Trainings for all Employees



For those companies which do have a non-discrimination and equal opportunity policy, the Index asks about the accessibility and dissemination of the policy to its job-seekers and employees.

In *Chart 8* below, companies largely displayed their policies publically but further efforts could be made to increase awareness on them among the staff.

#### Chart 8: Methods of displaying the policies



## SECTION III: POLICIES FOR RECRUITMENT AND EMPLOYEE RETENTION

In this section, the Index asked companies about the policies and procedures they have in place regarding recruitment and employee retention.

In *Chart 9* below, the statistics are concerning as well, because none of the companies include reference to LGBTIQ persons.

#### Chart 9: LGBTIQ Mention in the Recruitment Policy



Only 15% of companies, as shown in *Chart 10* below, have application forms and interview questions which are LGBTIQ-friendly. Doing so is a much more nuanced form of respecting the rights and upholding the dignity of LGBTIQ job-seekers but many companies lack the skills do so. This might include types of questions which do not force a gender-based answer or questions which are not invasive towards the lifestyle of the job-seeker. These also guarantee that the companies are not asking LGBTIQ job-seekers about their sexual orientation or gender identity through indirect means.

#### Chart 10: Application Forms





In *Chart 11* it is shown that company Human Resource or Recruitment Manager don't ask candidates and employees personal questions about their sexual orientation and/or gender identity, LGBTIQ identity, or any other type of question about gender or race. This is an outstanding result **85**% which shows that companies do not ask LGBTIQ employees indirectly questions about their sexual orientation.

#### Chart 11: Interview Questions

Question 3.3.: does the company Human Resource or Recruitment Manager ask candidates and employees individual questions about their sexual orientation and/or gender identity, LGBTIQ identity, or any other type of question about gender or race?



In *Chart 12*, it is shown that only 17% of the companies acknowledge that have recruited one or more LGBTIQ persons. This low figure is also due to the fact that the majority of companies do not ask information regarding sexual orientation and/or gender identity, since 32% of them answers 'don't know'.

#### Chart 12: LGBTIQ persons Recruitment



In *Chart 13* below, 92% of companies reported that they have a mechanism to report harassment on the job. This high number is a positive indicator and gives us hope that policies will start to change for better. But it is important that all employees know that such mechanisms exist so that they know any type of harassment would have consequences.

#### Chart 13: Mechanisms to Report Discrimination or Harassment

Question 3.6.: does the company have a mechanism in place to report discrimination or harassment based on gender identity and/or sexual orientation in the workplace?



Similarly, in *Chart 14* below, only 31% of companies had management staff trained on responding to such complaints of discrimination or harassment. This is troubling because of the 92% of companies which have a mechanism (see *Chart 13* above), only about half of those have management trained on responding. Obviously, this highlights the vulnerability of LGBTIQ persons on the job and their limited options for recourse if they are discriminated or harassed.

#### Chart 14: Staff Training

Question 3.7.: is someone in the company trained on how to deal with this if there is a compliant submitted on discrimination, bullying or harassment based on gender identity and/or sexual orientation in the workplace?



In *Chart 15*, only 28% of companies have a mechanism to evaluate and mitigate the safety and welfare concerns of LGBTIQ employees in the workplace. 28% of the companies stated that, they either have LGBTIQ persons working for them, or had and they always felt equal with all the other employees. In this percentage there were also few companies who declared that nobody from LGBTIQ community applied for a job there, and if they did, if they were professionally suitable for the position their sexual orientation wouldn't be a problem. Even so, this is only 28% and it is a very low percentage. This is not surprising given the low levels of companies with policies and trained management. Nevertheless, it highlights the vulnerability of LGBTIQ persons on the job.

#### **Chart 15:** Mechanisms to Evaluate and Mitigate the Safety and Welfare Concerns of LGBTIQ Employees



*Chart 16* asked companies if they had ever supported any initiatives to promote social and professional inclusion of minorities including LGBTIQ persons. From every few (only 8%) of the companies who supported social promotion and professional inclusion of LGBTIQ persons, there were mainly Media (TV Media) who covered events organized by them, and one of these Media made a documentary film of a LGBTIQ person who revealed his sexual orientations in public through the help of this documentary.

#### Chart 16: Company's Support to the Professional Inclusion of LGBTIQ Persons



### SECTION IV: CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY AND OUTREACH

This section asks about a company's corporate social responsibility and outreach to the community at large.

As *Chart 17* below shows, just under half of the companies have a CSR strategy already developed. This is positive because it at least provides the framework for adding more protections for LGBTIQ job-seekers and employees if the company is willing.

#### Chart 17: Corporate Social Responsibility Strategy





#### Chart 18: Specific Mention of LGBTIQ in the CSR strategy



*Chart 19* below shows that 95% of companies made charitable donations but only 5% did so to LGBTIQ-focused organizations or projects. In this low percentage are cases when media covers these events without pay, or there was one company who printed rainbow flags for an event organized by LGBTIQ community.

#### Chart 19: Charitable Donations by Companies

Question 4.3.: during the last two years, has the company made any donations or offered any sponsorships to charities or community-based organizations



*Chart 20*, shows that only 5% of companies joined any initiatives to support LGBTIQ equality and inclusion. While companies are interested in CSR, the issue of LGBTIQ persons does not represent a priority for their actions.

#### Chart 20: Company Support for LGBTIQ Initiatives





*In Chart 21* below, only 2% of companies have a policy or guidelines that prohibit them from doing business with other companies that discriminate about LGBTIQ persons (or other minorities).

# **Chart 21:** Policies to Prohibit Business Transactions with Businesses/Organizations which Discriminate

Question 4.6.: does the company have guidelines that prohibit doing business with companies or organizations that openly and actively discriminate against LGBTIQ people or any racial/religious minorities?



In *Chart 22*, a total of **86%** of participating companies did mention that they would be willing to work more on LGBTIQ inclusion. Despite the fact that many businesses lack policies or training on the topic, it is encouraging that a significant percentage would like to engage further. This creates the space for further projects.

#### Chart 22: Willingness to Work on LGBTIQ Inclusion Issues

Question 4.7.: would the company be interesting in becoming a member of a working group on business fairness in Kosovo (to share best practices and lessons learnt, promote advocacy and awareness on LGBTIQ equality and inclusion in the workplace)?



## SECTION V: LGBTIQ SPECIFIC INITIATIVES AND ACTIONS

In Section V, the Index asks companies for specific examples of work or support to LGBTIQ communities. Companies cannot achieve Gold status in this Index with having a proven track record of such actions.

As shown in *Chart 23* below, none of the companies reported to have initiatives which are innovative to LGBTIQ inclusion. This is a very conserning statistic.

#### Chart 23: Initiative Programs



# RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the analysis of results, The Headhunter has developed the following recommendations.

#### For the Kosovar Private Sector:

- Recognize that workplace diversity is positive for productivity, revenue, and employee retention.
- Recognize the need for and seek out training opportunities to improve the policies and practices for workplace diversity, for both LGBTIQ Kosovars and other minorities.
- Devote time and resources to upgrading policies and train all staff on those upgrades.
- Raise the issue of workplace diversity in syndicates, trade unions, chambers of commerce, and other business membership organizations.

#### For the Kosovar Government:

- Continue to enforce the 2015 Anti-Discrimination Law rigorously with an action plan containing concrete objectives and a timeline. This may include public awareness materials, standardized codes of conduct, standardized policies, and a website to access such information.
- Ensure a strong focus on employment inclusion for LGBTIQ Kosovars in the National Action Plan for LGBTIQ.

#### For International Donors:

 Continue to identify and fund evidence-based programs which produce tangible impacts on the lives of LGBTIQ Kosovar citizens.

#### For Organizations for LGBTIQ Equality and Tolerance

- Include employment related topics in their advocacy efforts.
- Spread information on the protections for LGBTIQ Kosovars in the 2015 Anti-Discrimination Law to the LGBTIQ community.
- Look for opportunities to make advocacy practical in producing tangible benefits for the lives of LGBTIQ Kosovars.

# a product of HeadHunter®